Honorable Mayor and Members
of the City Council
City Hall
Torrance, California

Members of the Council:

SUBJECT: City Manager – Consider adopting a RESOLUTION regarding the safety of the Torrance Refinery. Expenditure: None

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation of the City Manager that City Council consider adopting a RESOLUTION regarding the safety of the Torrance Refinery.

BACKGROUND/ANALYSIS

During the discussion relating to Item 9G on the March 7, 2017 City Council Agenda, Councilmember Tim Goodrich introduced a resolution regarding the safety of the Torrance Refinery. Upon further discussion, your Honorable Body requested that staff bring Councilmembers Goodrich’s proposed resolution and an alternate resolution for City Council consideration. Attached with this item are both versions for City Council discussion and direction. This item also includes copies of the letters sent to Assemblymemeeber Al Muratsuchi and Supervisor Janice Hahn expressing City’s support of their legislative efforts.

Respectfully submitted,

LeROY J. JACKSON
CITY MANAGER

By Aram Chapanyan
Assistant to the City Manager

CONCUR:

LeRoy J. Jackson
City Manager

Attachments: A) Resolution Proposed by Councilmember Tim Goodrich
B) Alternate Resolution
C) Community Flyer
D) Public Comments
E) Letters sent to Assemblymemeeber Al Muratsuchi and Supervisor Janice Hahn
Resolution Proposed by Councilman Tim Goodrich

RESOLUTION NO. 2017-___

A RESOLUTION BY THE TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL REGARDING
THE SAFETY OF THE TORRANCE REFINERY.

WHEREAS, the Torrance Refinery was established in 1929 and it and its
workers make numerous contributions to the local and regional economy; and

WHEREAS, the Torrance Refinery uses a highly toxic chemical, Modified
Hydrofluoric Acid (MHF), that if released, forms a ground hugging cloud and has the
potential to inflict numerous injuries and deaths; and

WHEREAS, the “Consent Decree” of 1990 called for an additive to Hydrofluoric
Acid (HF) that would have decreased the risk of a widespread disaster, but the additive
percentage was later decreased, thereby decreasing the safety factor; and

WHEREAS, the U.S. Chemical Safety Board termed the accident of February
18, 2015 a “near miss”; and

WHEREAS, the safety of Torrance residents and refinery workers must take the
utmost priority; and

WHEREAS, safer alternatives to MHF exist, liquid ionic technology is currently
being evaluated and appears promising, and the Norton Engineering “Alkylation
Technology Study” report indicates the commercial viability of converting an existing HF
Alkylation Unit.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE
CITY OF TORRANCE HEREBY calls for the phasing out of Modified Hydrofluoric Acid
at the Torrance refinery in exchange for a safer alternative.

INTRODUCED, APPROVED and ADOPTED this twenty eighth day of March, 2017.

____________________________
Mayor Patrick J. Furey

APPROVED AS TO FORM:
JOHN L. FELLOWS III, City Attorney

By:____________________________
Patrick Q. Sullivan, Assistant City Attorney

ATTEST:

____________________________
Rebecca Poirier
City Clerk
Alternate Resolution

RESOLUTION NO. 2017-__

A RESOLUTION BY THE TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL REGARDING THE SAFETY OF THE TORRANCE REFINERY.

WHEREAS, the Torrance Refinery was established in 1929 and it and its workers make numerous contributions to the local and regional economy; and

WHEREAS, the Torrance Refinery has experienced several operational challenges since the explosion on February 18, 2015, including excessive flaring, fires, and power interruptions; and

WHEREAS, the City of Torrance has taken an active role in coordinating efforts by various local, state and federal regulatory agencies tasked with refinery safety, regulations, and oversight; and

WHEREAS, the City of Torrance has held several public workshops to educate the community regarding refinery operations and safety; and

WHEREAS, the City of Torrance submitted a project for the $2.7 Million South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) Supplemental Environment Project (SEP) Fund Air Quality Improvement Projects for an offsite real-time air quality monitoring system with sirens available to the public, an enhanced integrated community alarm/notification system, and broad shelter-in-place air quality emergency preparedness community training; and

WHEREAS, the City of Torrance holds monthly meetings with representatives of the Torrance Refining Company and Southern California Edison to address electrical reliability concerns; and

WHEREAS, as part of California Governor Brown’s directive to create Refinery Emergency Preparedness and Safety Regulations, the Torrance Deputy Fire Chief is serving as the Chair of the Interagency Refinery Task Force Training Workgroup while participating on all rule making efforts by the California Environmental Protection Agency (Cal EPA) in developing the California Accidental Release Prevention (CalARP) and the California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR) - Occupational Safety & Health Standards Board (OSHSHB) for Process Safety Management for Petroleum Refineries; and

WHEREAS, the City of Torrance in partnership with the Torrance Refining Company (TRC) approved funding for 24-hour dedicated staffing to support the Torrance Alerts System; and

WHEREAS, City staff are members of the SCAQMD Working Group for proposed amended Rule 1118 (Control of Emissions from Refinery Flares) and will participate in the upcoming Rule 1410 (Hydrogen Fluoride Storage and Use) amendment process; and
WHEREAS, the City of Torrance supports ionic liquids alkylation technology that will enhance the safety of the Torrance Refinery; and

WHEREAS, the safety and security of Torrance residents and persons who work in the city is the highest priority for the Torrance City Council.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF TORRANCE HEREBY supports the efforts of the following government agencies and elected officials in ensuring and enhancing the safety of the Torrance Refinery and encourages all interested parties to continue to work together in addressing community concerns regarding the safety of the Torrance Refinery:

- California Interagency Refinery Task Force
- California Environmental Protection Agency (Cal EPA) in developing the California Accidental Release Prevention (CalARP)
- California Department of Industrial Relations (DIR) - Occupational Safety & Health Standards Board (OSHSB) for Process Safety Management for Petroleum Refineries
- South Coast Air Quality Management District Rule 1118 and Rule 1410 specifically related to flaring events and continued use of modified hydrofluoric acid (MHF)
- Monitoring of the efforts to seek a safer catalyst
- Torrance Refining Company and Southern California Edison electrical reliability project
- U.S. Chemical Safety Board
- Congressmember Maxine Waters and Congressmember Ted Lieu
- Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi’s legislative efforts
- County of Los Angeles Board of Supervisors

INTRODUCED, APPROVED and ADOPTED this twenty eight day of March, 2017.

Mayor Patrick J. Furey

APPROVED AS TO FORM:
JOHN L. FELLOWS III, City Attorney

By: _________________________________
Patrick Q. Sullivan, Assistant City Attorney

ATTEST:

______________________________
Rebecca Poirier
City Clerk
SPECIAL City Council VOTE ON THE REFINERY

Tuesday March 28, 2017 7 p.m.

BIG HF & MHF RISK

Hydrofluoric & Modified Hydrofluoric Acid

Torrance City Council Chambers 3031 Torrance Blvd., 90503

to:

BAN HF & MHF

We need 1000 People

To COME AND BE COUNTED ON For PUBLIC HEALTH AND SAFETY

* END THE FEAR *
Torrance City Councilmen Tim Goodrich & Kurt Weideman will introduce A Resolution / Ordinance to BAN HF & MHF Massive Storage and Use in Torrance Help Urge City Council Members for At Least 2 More “Yes” Votes to Protect Our Community's Health and Safety It's been 2 years since the MASSIVE FEB. 18, 2015 TORRANCE REFINERY EXPLOSION It may be NOW-OR-NEVER! PLEASE COME Refinery Safety Network Dr. Eng candidate for TORRANCE CITY COUNCIL 2016
Dear Councilmember Geoff Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,

Richard Au
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 2:57 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: MHF

-------- Original message -------
From: [redacted]
Date: 3/23/17 2:29 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: MHF

Mr. Rizzo,
I strongly urge you to vote for the phasing out of MHF at Torrance Refinery.
The risk is too great for the citizens of Torrance.
Thank you,
Sheryl Hohn

Sent from Mail for Windows 10
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 1:53 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

-------- Original message --------
From: Jason Seieroe
Date: 3/23/17 1:52 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Councilmember Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council is planning to vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

As a Torrance Resident and Torrance Refining Company employee, I ask you to allow the SCAQMD rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

I understand the concerns over the use of MHF, but as a 15 year employee of the refinery that has spent a significant amount of time working in our MHF Alkylation Unit, I don’t think the public would be served by a ban. I understand the hazards associated with MHF, both to the public and our employees, but I also understand the mitigations we have in place. If I didn’t think we could manage the risks of MHF, I wouldn’t feel so safe spending time in the unit, sending my employees into the unit, or having my family live close to the refinery.
An MHF ban would likely also result in a shutdown of the Torrance Refinery and the Valero Wilmington Refinery, causing significant loss of local high paying jobs and tax revenue, not to mention the impact on the local gasoline, jet, and diesel markets. The loss of income to my family may result in my family needing to leave our home in Torrance. We love our community in Torrance and don’t want to leave.

Please VOTE NO on Councilmember Goodrich’s resolution.

Sincerely,

Jason Seieroe
Dear Mr. Herring,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

I would like to tell you a little bit about myself, I started working in the HF Alkylation in 1988, which is now MHF Alkylation Unit in different jobs including Operator, Head Operator, Control Console Supervisor and Shift Team Lead throughout my 28+ years at the Torrance Refinery. Although I understand that you may not know that much about what I do, I have worked with this chemical for all this time and have the greatest respect for the chemical that I have worked with. I can’t even begin to tell you all of the scenarios that we train for or all of the unit checks that are made.

This MHF Alkylation Unit has some of the best safety mitigation in the United States, fire water mitigation system, deluge system, HF acid sensor detection system (down to the parts per million) which sends a signal to the AQMD, laser detection and a MHF acid dump system. We also have first responders on sight
that have been trained and certified in Hazmat, Rescue and Fire Brigade. All of our MHF Alkylation equipment is test on regular bases to ensure that they proper working. This chemical has been in this refinery since the 1960’s and there has never been any HF or MHF release that has ever even left this refinery or endangered any part of this community. I believe these are scare tactics by people that have not worked with the chemical or don’t understand the mitigations and regiment that we go through to make this the safest Alkylation unit.

Phasing out of HF is not a possibility for this refinery as Sulfuric Acid does not do the same thing as the HF acid does. It would not allow us to make low carb gasoline that is required by the State of California. There is no chemical right now to replace HF, that does the same thing as HF. The technology just is not there yet. Phasing out of HF without a viable replacement means that this refinery would be obsolete. Losing refinery jobs and contractor jobs, over 1200 jobs. People would lose their homes and the means to provide for their families. Please take all of these things in to consideration when you vote and I again urge you to Vote No.

Sincerely,
Donna Bender
Harbaugh, Arianne

Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Jackson, LeRoy
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 8:29 AM
To: Chaparyan, Aram; Barthe-Jones, Eleanor
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 8:01 AM
To: Ramsey, George W
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: Re: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you for your email.
Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

On Mar 23, 2017, at 7:58 AM, Ramsey, George W wrote:

Dear Council member Heidi Ashcraft,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

I have worked at the Torrance refinery for over 26 years, have lived within 11 miles of the plant my entire life, and intend on working there another ~15 years. I take great pride in my work, in my plant, and in our ability as a site to effectively control the hazards inherent to our business. A “Yes” vote for the MHF ban is essentially a death sentence to my refinery (many good paying jobs, and a lot of tax revenue for the city of Torrance). The risks to the community of an MHF release have been greatly exaggerated by the TRAA and their supporters/sympathizers. We have one of the most advanced Alky units in the world, with multiple layers of redundant safety systems to guard against a catastrophic release. We have NEVER had MHF leave – or even threaten to leave – our fence line. Please stop this measure before my livelihood is needlessly/unjustifiably taken away from me, and ~1,100 other hard working-class men and women from ALL backgrounds and ideologies (plus another ~1,000 other jobs provided through small businesses and companies that provide support services for the refinery would be jeopardized), as an eventual conclusion to the ban of MHF.

Sincerely,

George Ramsey
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Jackson, LeRoy
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 8:29 AM
To: Chaparyan, Aram; Barthe-Jones, Eleanor
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 8:06 AM
To: Tan, Lilian Ah
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: Re: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you for your email.

Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

On Mar 23, 2017, at 8:04 AM, Tan, Lilian Ah wrote:

Dear Councilmember Heidi,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

We understand that we have to earn the right to operate in the community, and we are committed to operating safely, reliably and environmentally responsibly. As a worker/supporter of the oil and gas industry for the past 3 decades, I make safety my priority. Workers like me go to our jobs each day with safety in mind, so that we can safely return home to our loved ones at the end of the day. We want the same thing for our community. A ban on MHF will jeopardize the viability of the Torrance Refinery and put refinery jobs at risk. It will also harm the region and the state’s economy when our products are removed from the market, which will create higher costs for the state’s consumers.
Without Alkylation, the Torrance Refinery would not be able to meet the California Air Resource Boards gasoline specifications to make the cleaner-burning gasoline required by the state, making the refinery obsolete.

I can assure you that safety is a priority for me and everyone that works at our refinery.

Sincerely,
Lilian Tan
Dear Councilmember Rizzo,

I am Ron Miller Executive Secretary of the Los Angeles/ Orange Counties Building & Construction Trades Council. I write to you today on behalf of over 100,000 Working Men, Women and their families who make up the membership of the 47 affiliated Local unions and District Councils that we represent. Many members and their families live in the City of Torrance and make up the workforce at the Torrance Refinery.

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

On behalf of the affiliates and their membership I would ask you to allow the South Coast Air Quality Management District rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

We urge you to VOTE NO.

The Torrance Refinery has played a big part of the local economy over the years with thousands of our members and their families from Torrance and the surrounding area making up the workforce. These local workers have made a good living and contributed to the local Torrance community, raised their families here and at the same time made Torrance a better place to live for all residents. Please do not let a small group of community members drive a campaign of misinformation and fear, please make every effort to turn the conversation from emotion to a conversation driven by actual facts.

Sincerely,

Ron Miller
Dear Councilmember Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,
Moahengi Fotu
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Thursday, March 23, 2017 7:58 AM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

-------- Original message --------
From: "Tse, Valerie B" [redacted]
Date: 3/22/17 6:41 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Council Member Geoff Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

As an employee of PBF, I don’t believe the average citizen has any idea of the real facts regarding MHF. As a logical individual, I feel it is important to get the facts straight and to ensure that the people making the opposing arguments are BASED on FACTS, not ASSUMPTIONS on partial facts – or motivated by some EMOTIONAL drive. Because the impacts of phasing out MHF has a HUGE impact to the city and the state’s economy as well as the average citizen who drives or flies, it is important that any decision regarding MHF be validated by the relevant agencies that were put in place to review and objectively come to a conclusion.

This is no different than if a Plastic Surgeon who graduated from Harvard in some other area of doctorate making allegation and opinions for a cancer patient. And the basis of the plastic surgeon’s opinion is from Google and a few articles or research published by the oncologist, but not even specific to the patient’s records (which would be private and therefore the plastic surgeon would need to make some assumptions) Would you trust the plastic surgeon’s opinion in this case and vote based on this?

Without knowing the whole story, how can the council rule based on an organization’s incomplete opinions. The source MUST be fact checked prior to any decisions.

Valerie B. Tse
Dear Council member Geoff Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

My name is Joel Sauerbier and I am a relatively new employee at the Torrance Refinery. I believe that with the change in control and PBF’s attitude and commitment to change and safety. We can turn Torrance Refinery around. I am proud to be a part of this change and look forward to seeing our refinery succeed as a producer for our economy as well as for my growing family. My wife and I recently found out that we are expecting our first child. Providing for my family and coming home safe everyday are two of the most driving factors in how I do my job. Please do not ban modified hydrofluoric acid.

Give us a chance

Sincerely.

Joel Sauerbier
Dear Councilmember Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich. I ask you to allow the South Coast Air Quality Management District rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid (MHF).

I urge you to VOTE NO on a Resolution to Phase Out MHF.

As an Environmental Scientist with approximately 20 years working in various industries, my biggest issue with TRAA & SBFLARE is that they are using scare tactics under the guise of “credible science” to manipulate the community and distract community leaders from making good decisions. Instead of using fear to drive the decision making process, our community leaders should be using solid evidence and quantitative risk assessments to mitigate the community’s biggest threats. A quantitative Risk Assessment involves 3 main steps:

1. Hazard Identification
2. Evaluation/Ranking of Consequence Severity & Frequency
3. Risk Control – how to mitigate hazard

For example, we all know flying on an airplane can result in death; however, most everyone flies without much risk of dying because the frequency of plane crashes is low, and there are appropriate controls in place to give us confidence that the relative risk of dying is very low. Similarly, using MHF in refinery alkylation processes may have a high consequence for the community, but statistics show that with adequate control measures, the risk of people dying from an incident is very, very low.

Note: there is NO place for fear in a quantitative risk assessment; it is based on actual numbers based on past events. I would dare say it’s unethical to use scare tactics to influence this process, and credible scientists understand this.
Petroleum refining is a complex industry and risk assessments are required by law when using certain chemicals, such as MHF, in large quantities. Our risk assessments are conducted with TFD oversight to ensure appropriate controls are in place to mitigate hazards.

I work as an Environmental Scientist at the Refinery and I can tell you with absolutely certainty that the risk of a catastrophe is so very low. I live in Torrance less than a mile away from the refinery, and I do not worry about MHF. Instead, I worry about my kids getting asthma from particulate matter (from cars, trucks, airplanes & combustion engines), and I worry that if you ban MHF, there is a real possibility the refinery will shut down and I’ll lose my job. Please VOTE NO on a resolution to Phase Out MHF.

Sincerely,
Diane Lynch
Resident of Torrance, Torrance Refining Company Employee, Environmental Scientist & Concerned Parent
Harbaugh, Arianne

Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Jackson, LeRoy
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:46 PM
To: Barthe-Jones, Eleanor; Chaparyan, Aram
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:45 PM
To: Montenegro, Jose; Arnoldo
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: RE: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you for your email.

Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

From: Montenegro, Jose
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:34 PM
To: Ashcraft, Heidi
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Ashcraft,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,
Jose Montenegro

Resident of Torrance

Jose Montenegro
DISCLAIMER: This email message and any attachments are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying or other use of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and permanently delete this message and any attachments.
Harbaugh, Arianne

Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Jackson, LeRoy
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:45 PM
To: Barthe-Jones, Eleanor; Chaparyan, Aram
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:07 PM
To: Johnson, Jeff
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: RE: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you Mr. Johnson for your email.

Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

From: Johnson, Jeff
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 2:03 PM
To: Ashcraft, Heidi
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Ashcraft,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,

Jeff Johnson
Torrance Refining Company
March 22, 2017

Mayor Patrick Furey &
Members of the City Council
City of Torrance City Hall
3031 Torrance Blvd.
Torrance, CA 90503

Dear Mayor Furey and Council Members:

My wife, Anita, and I have lived in North Torrance, about one mile from the refinery, for over 50 years and are greatly concerned for the safety of our community. Hydrogen Fluoride (HF) and Modified Hydrofluoric Acid (MHF) pose an extreme hazard should it be released due to a refinery accident, natural disaster such as an earthquake or terrorist act.

I worked for the City of Beverly Hills Fire Department for 30 years, the last 14 years as Chief of the Department. I have also served as President of the South Bay Fire Chiefs Association (2 years), The Los Angeles County Chapter of the California Fire Chiefs Association (2 years) and the California League of Cities Fire Department (2 years). I have performed the duties of firefighter, engineer, paramedic, captain and battalion chief. I have a concerned interest in the safety of our community both as a citizen and as a fire service professional.

While serving as Fire Chief I responded to two major incidents at the refinery with my Chiefs Car, turn out gear and served as a Staff Officer to the Incident Commander. Following the second incident, the Torrance City Council wrote a letter to the Beverly Hills City Council in appreciation for my assistance. The Beverly Hills Mayor at the time, Charles Aronberg, presented me with a city tile in recognition of my service to show their appreciation.

Having seen the overwhelming amount of evidence exposing the dangers of modified Hydrofluoric Acid (MHF), I strongly recommend that the City take action to stop the use of large quantities of MHF at the Torrance Refinery.

The danger presented by MHF to our community should a serious release of a HF toxic cloud occur could be similar to what occurred in Bhopal, India where 15,000 persons perished and
over 100,000 were injured as a result of the release of a toxic volatile gas, Methyl isocyanate or New York City's World Trade Center tragedy where almost 3,000 persons perished including 343 Firefighters and 6,000 persons were injured.

In 1989 The City of Torrance's own Public Nuisance Lawsuit claimed that 100,000 persons could be killed and double that injured should there be a HF release in our community. The danger is still the same today as what the City of Torrance claimed 27 years ago! The mitigation barriers that the industry touts are adequate measures of protection are not in the least bit adequate.

You must take action now to prevent the City of Torrance from being remembered for incurring a similar tragic incident as what has occurred in New York City and in Bhopal, India.

It is irresponsible to continue to expose the citizens of our city and surrounding cities to the hazards posed by a release of HF or MHF especially when an inherently safer chemical, sulfuric acid, is available.

It is equally irresponsible to ask our first responders, Firefighters and Police Officers to respond to HF or MHF incidents at the Torrance Refinery knowing that you, the City Council, could have taken action to prevent their exposure. Yes they will respond, even knowing the danger, they will respond. That is what we do to protect our community. Do not be mistaken that it is equally your duty to provide for the safety of our citizens and first responders to the best of your ability. Take action now to stop the use of HF and MHF at the Torrance Refinery.

I appreciate your consideration,

Bill Daley
Harbaugh, Arianne

Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF
Importance: High

From: Jackson, LeRoy
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:45 PM
To: Chaparyan, Aram; Barthe-Jones, Eleanor
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:15 PM
To: Saravia, Wilfredo
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: RE: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you for your email.

Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

From: Saravia, Wilfredo
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 1:18 PM
To: Ashcraft, Heidi
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Heidi Ashcraft,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of MHF acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

I've worked in this refinery for the past 16 years which has allow me to feed my wife and 3 children and one more on the way!

Sincerely,

Wilfredo Saravia Solis
Dear Council member Geoff R.,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,

Karina Carias
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 1:06 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

-------- Original message --------
From: "Ilog, Orlando L." [redacted]
Date: 3/22/17 1:01 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Geoff Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

I need a job to continue to support my family and I firmly believe that Torrance Refinery is very safe and environmentally safe to earn the right to continue to operate with preexisting design of the refinery.

Sincerely,
Orlando L. Ilog

DISCLAIMER: This e-mail message and any attachments are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying or other use of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and permanently delete this message and any attachments.
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 1:04 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

-------- Original message --------
From: "Decker, Charles L" [redacted]
Date: 3/22/17 12:57 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast AQMD rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid at this time.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Sincerely,

Charles L. Decker, PMP

---

DISCLAIMER. This e-mail message and any attachments are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying or other use of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and permanently delete this message and any attachments.
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 1:01 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

------- Original message -------
From: "Cotten, Dave"
Date: 3/22/17 12:49 PM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Geoff Rizzo

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Dave Cotten
Harbaugh, Arianne

From: City Clerk
Subject: FW: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Rizzo, Geoffrey
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 12:25 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

-------- Original message --------
From: "McTernan, Neil T" [Redacted]
Date: 3/22/17 11:29 AM (GMT-08:00)
To: "Rizzo, Geoffrey" <GRizzo@TorranceCA.gov>
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Dear Councilmember Rizzo,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Regards,

Neil McTernan

Torrance Refining Company

---

DISCLAIMER: This e-mail message and any attachments are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying or other use of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and permanently delete this message and any attachments.
Harbaugh, Arianne

Subject: RE: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

From: Ashcraft, Heidi
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 3:49 PM
To: Bockoff, Jared
Cc: Jackson, LeRoy
Subject: RE: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Thank you for your email

Heidi Ashcraft
Torrance City Council

From: Bockoff, Jared
Sent: Wednesday, March 22, 2017 11:25 AM
To: Ashcraft, Heidi
Subject: Vote NO on Resolution to Phase Out MHF

Heidi Ashcraft,

It is my understanding that the Torrance City Council will vote on a Resolution to phase-out modified hydrofluoric acid, brought forth by Councilmember Tim Goodrich.

I ask you to allow the South Coast rulemaking process to take its normal course of action and not predetermine the outcome by imposing a ban or phasing out of modified hydrofluoric acid.

I urge you to VOTE NO.

Don’t be pressured by misguided fears and public hysteria. My families livelihood is at stake.

Sincerely,

Jared Bockoff
Torrance Resident
March 15, 2017

Supervisor Janice Hahn
Los Angeles County 4th District
500 W. Temple Street, Room 822
Los Angeles, California 90012

Dear Supervisor Hahn,

The City of Torrance appreciates the interest, concern and efforts of you and your colleagues on the Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors as to the safety of our community. We share your desire to achieve the safest process for carrying out refinery operations in Torrance and the region.

The City, South Coast Air Quality Management District, Southern California Edison, Torrance Refining Company, and a number of community groups are all focused on safety at the refinery. This includes the alkarization process, reductions in flaring based on loss of electrical power and in maintaining an informed community. In the last two years, the City has conducted several public workshops designed to provide updates on refinery operations, electrical reliability, emergency alert systems, air monitoring, and other safety issues. The community participates in these workshops and provides valuable input. In addition, the City has had countless meetings with regulators and elected officials at the Federal and State levels discussing these issues and striving for ultimate safety in our City.

Looking to the future, state regulatory and legislative actions that impact both refining processes and community safety are under review, and the South Coast Air Quality Management District has two rules under development that address City and community concerns. City staff are participants in these deliberations.

Please know that we share a common goal which is the safety and security of our community. And, we will continue to work with all stakeholders, regulators, elected officials and the Torrance Refining Company, which continues to be an economic engine for the South Bay and Southern California, in meeting the goal.

Sincerely,

Patrick J. Furey
Mayor
March 10, 2017

Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi
23211 Hawthorne Boulevard, Suite 200A
Torrance, CA 90505

Dear Assemblymember Muratsuchi,

On behalf of the City Council, we would like to applaud your efforts for introducing bills to address the safety of our community and the Torrance Refining Company. At the March 7, 2017 City Council meeting, Council discussed the bills you have introduced and accepted comments from the public. It was concluded since these bills are in the early stages of the legislative process it would be premature to take a position on these bills.

The Torrance City Council would like to continue to work with you and your staff as these bills evolve and become more specific. The main focus is the safety of our community. Together with your office, the City of Torrance, the various governmental agencies, Torrance Refining Company, community groups, and other stakeholders we can focus on the main priority of “public safety.”

We look forward to work with you. Feel free to contact me or members of the Council to discuss these bills.

Sincerely,

Patrick J. Furey
Mayor